

ALMOST COMMUTING UNITARIES WITH SPECTRAL GAP ARE NEAR COMMUTING UNITARIES

TOBIAS J. OSBORNE

ABSTRACT. Let $\mathcal{M}_n$ be the collection of $n \times n$ complex matrices equipped with operator norm. Suppose $U, V \in \mathcal{M}_n$ are two unitary matrices, each possessing a gap larger than Δ in their spectrum, which satisfy $\|UV - VU\| \leq \epsilon$. Then it is shown that there are two unitary operators X and Y satisfying $XY - YX = 0$ and $\|U - X\| + \|V - Y\| \leq E(\Delta^2/\epsilon) \left(\frac{\epsilon}{\Delta^2}\right)^{\frac{1}{6}}$, where $E(x)$ is a function growing slower than $x^{\frac{1}{k}}$ for any positive integer k .

1. INTRODUCTION

An old problem from the 1950s, popularised by Halmos, asks: if a pair $\{A, B\}$ of matrices almost commute then are they necessarily close to a pair $\{A', B'\}$ of commuting matrices [14, 3, 1, 7, 13]? Voiculescu realised that this is not necessarily the case and presented a family of pairs of unitary matrices which asymptotically commute, but which were far from any commuting pair of matrices [15].

Since this time there has been considerable work on this problem culminating in 1995 with the proof of Lin that for any pair $\{A, B\}$ of *hermitian* matrices which satisfy $\|AB - BA\| \leq \epsilon$, with $\epsilon > 0$ and $\|A\|, \|B\| \leq 1$, there exists a hermitian pair $\{A', B'\}$ of matrices and $\delta(\epsilon) > 0$ such that $\|A' - A\| + \|B' - B\| \leq \delta(\epsilon)$ [9] (see [6] for a simplified exposition). The proof was nonconstructive and the dependence of δ on ϵ was not quantified, apart from the nontrivial fact that δ did not depend on the size of the matrices. Recently, Hastings [8] has presented a new constructive proof of the result of Lin and was able to calculate quantitative bounds.

In light of the recent results of [8] it is worthwhile to reconsider the problem of when a pair of almost commuting unitary matrices are near a pair of commuting unitaries. There have been several studies of this problem, partially motivated by Voiculescu's original counterexample, and it was quickly realised that there was, in general, a K -theoretic obstruction [4, 5]. When this obstruction vanishes it was shown that, indeed, a pair of almost commuting unitaries is close to a commuting pair [10, 11]. Again, the proof was nonconstructive, and quantitative bounds not provided. In this paper we partially ameliorate this situation by proving the following

Theorem 1.1. *Let U and V be two unitary operators such that*

$$(1.1) \quad \|[U, V]\| \leq \epsilon,$$

Date: September 3, 2008.

2000 Mathematics Subject Classification. Primary 15A15, 15A27, 47A55; Secondary 47B47.

where $[U, V] = UV - VU$, and also such that there exists $0 < \Delta_1 < \pi$ and $0 < \Delta_2 < \pi$ with¹

$$(1.2) \quad \text{spec}(U) \subset S^1 \setminus [-\Delta_1, \Delta_1], \quad \text{and} \quad \text{spec}(V) \subset S^1 \setminus [-\Delta_2, \Delta_2].$$

Then there exist two commuting unitary operators X and Y such that

$$(1.3) \quad \|U - X\| \leq \delta(\epsilon/(\Delta_1\Delta_2)), \quad \text{and} \quad \|V - Y\| \leq \delta(\epsilon/(\Delta_1\Delta_2))$$

where $\delta(x) = E(1/x)x^{\frac{1}{6}}$ and $E(x)$ grows slower than $x^{1/k}$ for any positive integer k .

The proof of theorem 1.1 is based on three observations. The first is that the principle branch of the matrix logarithm of a unitary matrix U with spectral gap can be represented in terms of a rapidly convergent Laurent series in U . The second observation is that the matrix logarithms $\{A, B\}$ of a pair $\{U, V\}$ of approximately commuting unitaries must themselves be approximately commuting, so they are close to a pair of commuting matrices $\{A', B'\}$. The final observation is that these commuting matrices give rise to a commuting pair $\{X, Y\}$ of unitaries close to $\{U, V\}$.

2. LOGARITHMS OF UNITARY MATRICES WITH SPECTRAL GAP

Theorem 2.1. *Let $U \in \mathcal{M}_n$ be a unitary matrix such that there exists a gap Δ with $0 < \Delta < \pi$ such that*

$$(2.1) \quad \text{spec}(U) \subset S^1 \setminus [-\Delta, \Delta].$$

Then the principle branch of the matrix logarithm of U may be represented as a Laurent series

$$(2.2) \quad \log(U) = -i \sum_{k=-\infty}^{\infty} c_k U^k$$

where $|c_k| \leq \min\{\pi, C/(\Delta k^4)\}$ and C is constant.

Remark 2.2. This result is adapted from a physical argument developed in [12].

Proof. We begin by calculating the eigenvalues and eigenvectors for U :

$$(2.3) \quad Uv_j = e^{i\phi_j} v_j,$$

where v_j are the eigenvectors of U and we choose $\phi_j \in [0, 2\pi)$. (If the gap in U 's spectrum was not centred on 0 we could, by multiplying by an overall phase $e^{i\zeta \mathbb{I}}$, $\zeta \in \mathbb{R}$, arrange for the zero of angle to lie at the origin. Such a gap always exists for finite dimensional unitary matrices, but not necessarily for infinite operators.)

We want to find a hermitian matrix H so that $U = e^{iH}$ and $Hv_j = \phi_j v_j$. To do this we suppose that

$$(2.4) \quad H = \sum_{k=-\infty}^{\infty} d_k U^k,$$

¹We denote the unit circle in the complex plane by S^1 . Where obvious we identify subintervals of $[-\pi, \pi)$ with their image in S^1 under the map $e^{i\phi}$.

and we solve for the coefficients d_k : by applying both sides of the above equation to the common eigenvector v_j we find that

$$(2.5) \quad \phi_j = \sum_{k=-\infty}^{\infty} d_k e^{ik\phi_j}.$$

Hence, if we can find d_k such that

$$(2.6) \quad \theta = \sum_{k=-\infty}^{\infty} d_k e^{ik\theta},$$

for all $\theta \in [0, 2\pi)$ then we are done. (Recall that we've arranged it so there are no eigenvalues of U at the point $\theta = 0$.) To solve for d_k we integrate both sides of (2.6) with respect to θ over the interval $[0, 2\pi)$ against $\frac{1}{2\pi}e^{-il\theta}$, for $l \in \mathbb{Z}$:

$$(2.7) \quad \frac{1}{2\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} \theta e^{-il\theta} d\theta = \frac{1}{2\pi} \sum_{k=-\infty}^{\infty} d_k \int_0^{2\pi} e^{i(k-l)\theta} d\theta.$$

Thus we learn that the d_k are nothing but the fourier coefficients of the periodic sawtooth function $f(\theta + 2\pi l) = \theta$, $\theta \in [0, 2\pi)$, $l \in \mathbb{Z}$:

$$(2.8) \quad d_k = \begin{cases} \pi, & k = 0 \\ \frac{i}{k}, & k \neq 0. \end{cases}$$

Unfortunately the sawtooth wave has a jump discontinuity and hence the fourier series is only conditionally convergent. The way to proceed is to assume that we have some further information, namely, that U has a gap Δ in its spectrum.

The idea now is to exploit the existence of the gap to provide a more useful series representation for H . We do this by calculating the fourier coefficients c_k of the sawtooth wave $f(\theta)$ convolved with a sufficiently smooth smearing function $\chi_\gamma(\theta)$; the fourier series inherits a better convergence from the smoothness properties of the smearing function. That is, we define c_k to be the fourier coefficients of

$$(2.9) \quad g(\theta) = (f \star \chi_\gamma)(\theta) = \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} f(\theta - y) \chi_\gamma(y) dy.$$

We choose χ_γ to be the function

$$(2.10) \quad \chi_\gamma(x) = \begin{cases} \left(1 - \left(\frac{x}{\gamma}\right)^2\right)^3, & |x| \leq \gamma \\ 0, & |x| > \gamma. \end{cases}$$

The fourier transform $\widehat{\chi}_\gamma(t) \equiv \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \chi_\gamma(x) e^{ixt} dx$ satisfies

$$(2.11) \quad |\widehat{\chi}_\gamma(t)| \leq \frac{C}{\gamma t^3},$$

where C is a constant. Note that, as a consequence of the compact support of $\chi_\gamma(y)$, $g(\theta) = f(\theta)$, $\forall \theta \in (\gamma, 2\pi - \gamma)$. An application of the convolution theorem then tells us that the fourier coefficients d_k are given by

$$(2.12) \quad c_k = \widehat{\chi}_\gamma(k) d_k.$$

Choosing $\gamma < \Delta$ allows us to conclude that

$$(2.13) \quad H = \sum_{k=-\infty}^{\infty} c_k U^k$$

because both $f(\theta)$ and $g(\theta)$ agree on the spectrum of U . According to (2.11) we now have that $|c_k| \leq \min\{\pi, C/(\Delta k^4)\}$. $\square$

3. CONSTRUCTING COMMUTING LOGARITHMS

In this section we exploit the following theorem of Hastings.

Theorem 3.1 ([8]). *Let A and B be hermitian, $n \times n$ matrices, with $\|A\|, \|B\| \leq 1$. Suppose $\|[A, B]\| \leq \epsilon$. Then there exist hermitian $n \times n$ matrices A' and B' such that*

$$(1) \quad [A', B'] = 0, \text{ and} \\ (2) \quad \|A' - A\| \leq \delta(\epsilon) \text{ and } \|B' - B\| \leq \delta(\epsilon), \text{ with} \\ (3.1) \quad \delta(\epsilon) = E(1/\epsilon)\epsilon^{\frac{1}{6}},$$

where the function $E(x)$ grows slower than $x^{\frac{1}{k}}$ for any positive integer k . The function $E(x)$ does not depend on n .

Proof of theorem 1.1. The first step of the proof is to exploit the presence of the spectral gap and use theorem 2.1 to represent the logarithms A and B of $U = e^{iA}$ and $V = e^{iB}$ via Laurent series with fast decay:

$$(3.2) \quad A = \sum_{j=-\infty}^{\infty} c_j U^j$$

and

$$(3.3) \quad B = \sum_{k=-\infty}^{\infty} d_k V^k,$$

with

$$(3.4) \quad |c_j| \leq \min\{\pi, C/(\Delta_1 j^4)\}, \quad |d_k| \leq \min\{\pi, C/(\Delta_2 k^4)\},$$

where C is a constant.

Now that we have an expression for A and B we can work out the norm of their commutator using the Leibniz property via

$$(3.5) \quad \begin{aligned} [A, B] &= \sum_{j=-\infty}^{\infty} \sum_{k=-\infty}^{\infty} c_j d_k [U^j, V^k] \\ &= \sum_{j=-\infty}^{\infty} \sum_{k=-\infty}^{\infty} \sum_{m=1}^j \sum_{n=1}^k c_j d_k V^{m-1} U^{n-1} [U, V] U^{j-n} V^{k-m}, \end{aligned}$$

and then taking the norm of both sides. Applying the triangle inequality and the unitary invariance of the operator norm gives us

$$(3.6) \quad \begin{aligned} \|[A, B]\| &\leq \sum_{j=-\infty}^{\infty} \sum_{k=-\infty}^{\infty} jk |c_j| |d_k| \|[U, V]\| \leq \epsilon \left(\sum_{j=-\infty}^{\infty} j |c_j| \right) \left(\sum_{k=-\infty}^{\infty} k |d_k| \right) \\ &\leq \epsilon \frac{\alpha}{\Delta_1 \Delta_2}, \end{aligned}$$

where α is a constant coming from C^2 and the summation of the separate infinite series.

The next step is to apply theorem 3.1 to construct two commuting operators A' and B' such that

$$(3.7) \quad \|A' - A\| \leq \delta(\epsilon\alpha/\Delta_1\Delta_2), \quad \text{and} \quad \|B' - B\| \leq \delta(\epsilon\alpha/\Delta_1\Delta_2).$$

and then, via exponentiation, we define $U' = e^{iA'}$ and $V' = e^{iB'}$. The distance between U' and U can be bounded as follows (following [2], p. 252):

$$(3.8) \quad \|U' - U\| \leq \int_0^1 \|A' - A\| ds \leq \epsilon,$$

and similarly for V' . Redefining $E(x)$ gives the result. $\square$

REFERENCES

1. I. David Berg and Kenneth R. Davidson, *Almost commuting matrices and the Brown-Douglas-Fillmore theorem*, Bull. Amer. Math. Soc. **16** (1987), no. 1, 97–100. MR 866023 (88a:47022)
2. Ola Bratteli and Derek W. Robinson, *Operator algebras and quantum statistical mechanics. 2*, 2nd ed., Texts and Monographs in Physics, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, 1997. MR 98e:82004
3. Kenneth R. Davidson, *Almost commuting Hermitian matrices*, Math. Scand. **56** (1985), no. 2, 222–240. MR 813638 (87e:47012)
4. Ruy Exel and Terry Loring, *Almost commuting unitary matrices*, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc. **106** (1989), no. 4, 913–915. MR 975641 (89m:15003)
5. Ruy Exel and Terry A. Loring, *Invariants of almost commuting unitaries*, J. Funct. Anal. **95** (1991), no. 2, 364–376. MR 1092131 (92a:46083)
6. Peter Friis and Mikael Rørdam, *Almost commuting self-adjoint matrices—a short proof of Huaxin Lin's theorem*, J. Reine Angew. Math. **479** (1996), 121–131. MR 1414391 (97i:46097)
7. P. R. Halmos, *Some unsolved problems of unknown depth about operators on Hilbert space*, Proc. Roy. Soc. Edinburgh Sect. A **76** (1976/77), no. 1, 67–76. MR 0451002 (56 #9292)
8. M. B. Hastings, *Making Almost Commuting Matrices Commute*, arXiv:0808.2474, 2008.
9. Hua Xin Lin, *Almost commuting unitary elements in purely infinite simple C^* -algebras*, Math. Ann. **303** (1995), no. 4, 599–616. MR 1359951 (96k:46101)
10. Huaxin Lin, *Almost commuting selfadjoint matrices and applications*, Operator algebras and their applications (Waterloo, ON, 1994/1995), Fields Inst. Commun., vol. 13, Amer. Math. Soc., Providence, RI, 1997, pp. 193–233. MR 1424963 (98c:46121)
11. ———, *Almost commuting unitaries and classification of purely infinite simple C^* -algebras*, J. Funct. Anal. **155** (1998), no. 1, 1–24. MR 1622808 (99e:46070)
12. Tobias J. Osborne, *Approximate locality for quantum systems on graphs*, arXiv:quant-ph/0611231, 2006.
13. Peter Rosenthal, *Research Problems: Are Almost Commuting Matrices Near Commuting Matrices?*, Amer. Math. Monthly **76** (1969), no. 8, 925–926. MR 1535586
14. Stanisław J. Szarek, *On almost commuting Hermitian operators*, Proceedings of the Seventh Great Plains Operator Theory Seminar (Lawrence, KS, 1987), vol. 20, 1990, pp. 581–589. MR 1065854 (91f:47032)
15. Dan Voiculescu, *Asymptotically commuting finite rank unitary operators without commuting approximants*, Acta Sci. Math. (Szeged) **45** (1983), no. 1-4, 429–431. MR 708811 (85d:47035)

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS, ROYAL HOLLOWAY, UNIVERSITY OF LONDON, EGHAM, TW20 0EX, UK

E-mail address: tobias.osborne@rhul.ac.uk